APPENDIX 7: PORTFOLIO

Contents

Introduction to Analysis of Projects and Settings 1

Making Projects:
Making Project One: Well Restoration 3
Making Project Two: Storytelling 5
Making Project: Buksh Museum of Hobbycraft 15

Topography of Commitment:
Committees of Maintenance 23
Comparison: Shahi Masjid and Sikawar Mandir 26
Inter-basti Civic Settings: Analysis of Workshop Sites 33
Interior-basti civic Settings: Analysis of Workshop Sites 60
Heritage Transect Walks 78
Peripheral Urban Heritage 83
Celebrated Civic Settings 84
Analysing the Topography of Commitment to Place: Introduction

Communicative Order

The communicative order of each setting is described using a diagram siting the setting’s architectural elements between topography and articulation after Vesely (2004).

Example: Souvenir Emporium, Main Road

- Glass facades - allows views of products from vehicles, and one-time visitors more likely to enter (tourists)
- Flat road - large construction so basements can be afforded too
- Buildings open to road, with backs to the bastis behind (shuts off view of and access to bastis)
- Threshold - can be guarded, not a place for spending time

Civic Possibilities

The civic possibilities of each setting are looked at in terms of the Opportunity to Encounter Difference; the Opportunity to Negotiate the Setting’s Urban Conditions and the Metaphoric Depth of the Urban Negotiation adapted from Carl (2015).

Example: Madrasa

- The madrasa has a large verandah facing a narrow lane. It is not visible to those passing by, and the few entrance doors can take place to the left and right. The madrasa is simply decorated, and the entrance door is open, allowing both visitors and residents to pass through the space to the bazaar.
- No traditional framework for spending time here, therefore it is not a site for significant activity.

Articulation

Factor affects

Factor affects

Topography

Embodiment

Communication

Articulation

Opportunity for contest

Factors affect intensity of use / anonymity

see p38

Communication

Civic Possibilities

The civic possibilities of each setting are looked at in terms of the Opportunity to Encounter Difference; the Opportunity to Negotiate the Setting’s Urban Conditions and the Metaphoric Depth of the Urban Negotiation adapted from Carl (2015).

Example: Madrasa
Making Project 1: Well Restoration

Making Project 2: Storytelling

Making Project 3: Buksh Museum of Hobbycraft

Making Projects
Most participants sit in a circle to discuss the workshop and share photographs.

Raj Mistry and assistant carry out the restoration work, with a small cluster of onlookers.

Donkeys bring bricks from derelict site nearby.

Group discussion.

Smaller group watches restoration.

Raj Mistry.

Residents fill in discussion book.

Residents show the historical structures prior to event.

Making Project One **Well Restoration**: Exercise Proceedings
### Making Project One Well Restoration: Evolving Design Process

#### Key:
- **= damaged area
- **= subterranean structure appears in good condition

#### Ground Level Plan

- **Red sandstone platform:** repair to cracks needed
- **Red sandstone and brick step around well:** only minor repairs to cracks needed.
- One pillar rebuilt in new bricks. Rebuild in mughal bricks.

- **Disused and broken drain:** no repair needed
- **Red sandstone paving:** good condition.

- **Main well structure:** made of small mughal bricks. In bad state of repair, many bricks damaged or missing. Bricks need to be replaced using lime mortar, to prevent further damage from water/plants/structural weakness.

- **Potential water damage from water running down wall from taps:** tiles/waterproof coating needed

#### Initial Well Repair Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Width (ft)</th>
<th>Height (ft)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6'-7&quot;</td>
<td>2'-0&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2'-0&quot;</td>
<td>4'-7&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5'-8&quot;</td>
<td>3'-11&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1'-4&quot;</td>
<td>2'-10&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2'-11&quot;</td>
<td>2'-1&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2'-6&quot;</td>
<td>3'-1&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1'-6&quot;</td>
<td>1'-6&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1'-11&quot;</td>
<td>1'-4&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4'-4&quot;</td>
<td>1'-5&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4'-4&quot;</td>
<td>4'-4&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### PHOTOGRAPH FROM TEMPLE TOWARDS STREET

#### Key Plan

- North Wall: extensive damage and brick loss to this area of well structure, causing structural instability and deterioration due to water ingress. Damaged bricks to be removed and replaced with mughal size bricks, using lime mortar.
- North Wall: extensive damage and brick loss - see above.

#### Elevation DD

- **North Pillar:** top three brick courses damaged and needs replacing or repointing.
- **Top course of bricks damaged and needs replacing or repointing.**

#### Section DD

- **Top three courses of bricks damaged and needs replacing or repointing.**

#### Elevation CC

- **South Pillar:** see above
- **Remove damaged plaster from top of structure.** Replace badly damaged bricks and repoint others with lime mortar.
- **Small hole:** fill with mughal size bricks and lime mortar.

#### Section CC

- **Remove damaged plaster from top of structure.** Replace badly damaged bricks and repoint others with lime mortar.

#### Structure before restoration

- **South Pillar:** top three brick courses damaged. Top half of plaster coating badly discoloured, and should be removed before brick repair to determine full extent of damaged bricks.
- **This section of wall on the street is permanently damp due to taps running from public water tank.** Tiles/damp proof treatment to tank wall could prevent future damage.

#### Structure after workshop

#### Structure four months after workshop
Diwanjika Mohalla: exhibition and preparation take place across the main chowk. Surrounding families, passers-by, and market traders participate.

Bilochpura: exhibition takes place in streets off the main chowk. Main chowk stays empty, preparation takes place in family courtyards and Madrasa. Surrounding families participate.

Making Project Two *Storytelling*: Opportunity to Encounter Difference During Exhibition
When women were mourning a deceased relative on the proposed day of the workshop, it had to be delayed: during this time people passing through the chowk were silent.

When women were no longer mourning, nobody opposed any aspect of the workshop: it met very little resistance.

There is a certain degree of expected behaviour in the DkM chowk in order for particular activities to be able to happen there at certain times, but the expectations of behaviour in Bilochpura Mosque Chowk have a greater degree of complexity, and residents commit to them every day (although there is still a cyclical element).

The exercise had to be delayed until the Islamic month of Muharram was over - Muharram mourning rituals were carried out in the chowk at this time.

The Consistent Collaborators who put out the exhibitions (partially checking with the Maulvi) decided that the streets directly off the main chowk were the best place to display the paper plaques - slightly more noise was tolerated here. However, by prayer time, everything had to be removed and cleaned up. They decided not to exhibit plaques on the main bazaar street, as the negotiation would require too many people / would take too long / would become too busy (out of control).

Maulvi checks on the exhibition proceedings
Exhibition does not take place in the bazaar street
Consistent Collaborators curate the exhibition
Initial meeting to get Maulvi's permission
Muharram canopy
Muharram ritual in the chowk

Bilochpura

Making Project Two Storytelling: Opportunity to Negotiate Urban Conditions During Exhibitions

Bilochpura Diwanji ka Mohalla
This is Diwanji ka Mohalla Shiva Temple. Kushwah people also have another temple (LAXMI NARAYAN MANDIR) Kushwah people mostly live in Deewan ji ka mohalla into taj ganj area and all of them involve in making garlands with flowers. Kushwah known for RAJA NAL during the time of lord Rama. RAJA NAL AND NIEL supported to lord RAMA to make bridge into see. Letter on so many kings of Kushwah happened here like RAJA MAAN SINGH, Raja jay Singh but originally this Kushwah caste comes from RAJA NAL. Deewan ji ka mohalla having mostly Kushwah (Hindus families). These Kushwah families having a temple at bank of the river Yamuna near crematory call as SHAMSHANGHAT which is older than this well is over 350 years old. It dried up 20 years back after people started building hotels in Tajganj. It is said that 25 years back six partners was doing farming here this area was till rai family but five partners out of six sold this area and also they built their own houses here. Six partners are: Raghunath, Gorelal, Hari singh, Narayan singh, Tara chandra, and Bablu. Raghunath didn't sold own land still using for agriculture having an ancient well which is known as CHOWK IN TARA means there are four room channel into the well.

This platform used to be the only location of the flower market but now there are several other locations where flowers are sold, and this platform is not used for selling flowers anymore.

The panchayat hall is used during weddings in the chowk. It is used sometimes for cooking and preparing food, also for storing the cooking equipment. It is not used for committee meetings any more.

Pathawari is a little temple of goddess Durga. People come here for worship. They celebrate festival nine days of goddess Durga and each Monday women sing devotional songs and play the drums. After marriage ladies bring DULHAN for worship. Nobody do aarti here. Kamala Devi is a lady, she look after this temple. She does cleaning, worship everyday. She washes the clothes of goddess Durga within a week. During festival or events she organizes a little Bhandara. Some people also participate in these events. Most of the urban places that these stories referred to were highly articulate, or contained articulate elements.
Stories placed in Diwanji ka Mohalla Temple Chowk

Places referred to in the stories

Plots referred to in the stories

Making Project Two Storytelling: Resident-curated Exhibition
This place is called Bilochpura because Bilochi people settled here. People came from Bilochistan in Afghanistan for work. Now every caste of people live here.

In front of my house is a little mosque called Alam Shahid Baba. When the construction of Taj was going on, he was doing work in that construction. He died and we have an Urs every year. People come from very far to attend this anniversary and we enjoy it.

The Royal Mosque was built before the Taj Mahal. People pray here five times a day and wear Salwar and Kamiz. The men wear pant, shirt and kurta. Everyone helps everybody else and the food is meat, fish, wheat, rice and sometimes people eat chow mein and burgers.

This mosque is known as Kabristan Mosque - it is very important in itself. When somebody dies, people come here to pray Namaz of Zanaza. There was a film shoot here in 1990. Actors included Dilip Kumar, Sanjeev Kumar and others.

The tombs are of Maedum Shah Huseini and Chisti Rahmatullah and they were doctors with natural powers. Back then the people here were tall - like 7 or 8 feet.

This is an nice area - everybody helps each other. It has a kabristan and behind this kabristan, there is the Mughal Hotel.

This house is a big house but as the family members have increased, this house has been divided. During my father’s childhood this house became ruined and has been repaired many times. The roof has been changed three or four times. This house had three doors but now just has one single door and another part of the house was built 5 years ago.

Making Project Two Storytelling: Resident-curated Exhibition

Almost all of the places that stories referred to were highly articulate, or contained articulate elements.
Making Project Two Storytelling: Opportunity to Encounter Difference During Furniture Placement
Making Project Two Storytelling: Opportunity to Negotiate Urban Conditions During Furniture Placement
Diwanji ka Mohalla: Market Street

Permission to place furniture:
- All Prohibited Zone against east wall: YES
- All Prohibited Zone: NO
- Private market plot: NO

Market traders agree to take collective responsibility for seats here (feel that ASI will be lenient if placed next to wall, and the spot is adjacent to area they already occupy)

Photo shows that by the next field trip, the furniture in this spot had been replaced by residents with a shade structure and bench - the testing in this exercise had construct testing gathering in this particular place.

Market traders do not feel that ASI will allow the seats to remain in this area, do not feel they can take responsibility for any part of this area (except next to wall)

Market plot owner does not wish to take responsibility for seats.

Female family members of house on the site do not want any more crowds entering their garden.

Making Project Two Storytelling: Opportunity to Negotiate Urban Conditions during Furniture Placement
There is a civic ‘sweet spot’ between privately owned sites, and sites where there is not even an agreed way to take responsibility for them for a period of time (hosting). At this sweet spot, people can negotiate their urban conditions. One of the two examples of such places found in the exercise is a committee-maintained setting: the committee feel able to look after the furniture. The other example is a place where a group of residents feel able to bring the furniture into the testing of acceptable occupation.
Making Project Two Storytelling: Metaphoric Depth of Urban Negotiation - Communication of Common Interests
Making Project Three *Buksh Museum of Hobbycraft*: Event #1
Making Project Three Buksh Museum of Hobbycraft: Re-using Rubble
Making Project Three *Buksh Museum of Hobbycraft*: Gardening
Making Project Three Buksh Museum of Hobbycraft: Earth Floor
Making Project Three *Buksh Museum of Hobbycraft*: Bamboo, Borrowed Materials and Fabric Structures
Making Project Three Buksh Museum of Hobbycraft: Exhibits and Ornament
Making Project Three *Buksh Museum of Hobbycraft*: Event #2
Proposed Repairs Granted by the ASI - negotiation between ASI, CURE architects, myself, Buksh family

Additions not considered 'construction' on Level 01 - negotiation between Buksh family

Meeting Place for women's savings groups on rooftop - negotiation between savings group, CURE, Buksh family, myself, architecture students

Museum Exhibition and Internet Cafe - negotiation between craftspeople, Buksh family, CURE, myself, architecture students

Cyclical Museum Event - negotiation between Buksh family, craftspeople, Mosque Committee, Press, Tourism Board, myself, CURE, architecture students

Making Project Three *Buksh Museum of Hobbycraft*: Design Proposal (Post-exercise)
Committees of Maintenance: Relationships Between Committees and Places

The web of committee 'alliances' has been shaped over time since bastis were distinct villages represented by committees, (mosque committee or panchayat depending on religion), to manage village and inter-village disputes. The committees had mainly moved to be situated along the primary bazaar street. While the resident-identified sites of interest had caused the creation and sustained the existence of this institutionalised cooperation, uncelebrated fragments such as the bazaar street itself were found to be essential to their operation too (see p43-46).

Committees of Maintenance: Relationships Between Committees and Places
Committees of Maintenance

Kabristan Committee
- Lobby for streetlights and amenities
- Keep burial rights for this community
- Sort out arguments
- Arrange festivals
- Stop encroachment
- Pay for gravedigger and building for resting the bodies
- Children play here
- Priests sweeping
- Committee constituent
- Area maintained by committee

Grave Committee
- Arranged
- Pray
- Children play
- Committee constituent
- Area maintained by committee

Meeting the committee: Fieldtrip 4
- Graves
- Maintenance Committee
- All Residents
- Play
- Children play in clean open space

Meeting the committee: Fieldtrip 3
- Play
- Maintenance Committee
- All Residents
- Committee constituent
- Area maintained by committee
Sikawar Temple Committees

- Committees: All Residents
- Animals graze in open space
- Pray
- Marble work
- Arrange festivals
- Look after open space outside
- Use for water and washing
- Arrange
- Look after open space outside
- Play
- All Residents

Lodi Temple Committees

- Committees: All Residents
- Worship
- Control jasmine trading
- Sort out issues
- Arrange annual fair
- Participate in fair
- Control their part of bazaar street
- Water
- Spend time in open space
- Area maintained by committee
- Area where committee constituents meet
- Committee meeting point

Committees of Maintenance
Comparison of Maintenance: Shahi Masjid 1614 -1803

- Women collect well water for household chores
- People enter the Masjid from the north as well as the east
- Priests treat the sick with distilled water from well (local legend)
- Tank is filled with water from the well via underground channel
- Street level rooms rented out to traders to make money for the mosque
- Farmers sell grain
- Prayer is held five times a day

Note: Diagrams illustrate the various activities and functions of the Shahi Masjid during its maintenance period.
Comparison of Maintenance: Shahi Masjid 1803-1947 (British-colonial period)
Many people move into the area and build/adjust houses. Road (previously earth) is tarmacked, drains are put in at both sides. Road is higher than previous, leading to ground floor flooding of many houses up to present day.

ASI conservation work: new stone pieces added to replace damaged. New flooring to external courtyard. New plastering at street level. Tank is re-lined and channel to well is closed.

ASI conservation work: new staircase entrance from road side.

Tourists / historians come to visit the Monument.

Prayer/Namaz held five times a day.

Farmers sell grain.

Women no longer collect well water for household chores – water has dried up. Water table lowered.

Men no longer enter the Masjid from the north as well as the east due to restoration work. People did not tend to gather in this chowk any more.

Graves of saints – women make wishes at these graves, tie a ribbon to the screen until the wish comes true.

People no longer enter the Masjid from the north as well as the east due to restoration work.* People did not tend to gather in this chowk any more.

Women no longer collect well water for household chores – water has dried up. Water table lowered. Women no longer enter the Masjid from the north as well as the east due to restoration work.* People did not tend to gather in this chowk any more.

Graves of saints – women make wishes at these graves, tie a ribbon to the screen until the wish comes true.

Tank is no longer filled with water from the well via underground channel, due to restoration work.*

Graves of saints – women make wishes at these graves, tie a ribbon to the screen until the wish comes true.

Comparison of Maintenance: Shahi Masjid 1947 - 2005
Houses continue to be added to. However, the 1992 100m rule stopped it being legal to build any new houses around the Masjid. Any unoccupied plots at this time remain unoccupied.

Tourists/historians continue to come to visit the Monument.

Prayer/namaz held five times a day.

Graves of saints - women make wishes at these graves, tie a ribbon to the screen until the wish comes true.

New wash facilities added (sink, WC).

Comparison of Maintenance: Shahi Masjid 2005 - 2014
Speakers added for call to prayer
Steel frame and corrugated steel shade added for prayer and for washing
New electric floodlights
Banners, lights and flowers decorate the steel structures during festivals
Shop interiors refitted

Comparison of Maintenance: New, Cyclical and Temporary Adjustments to the Shahi Masjid Since 2000

Temporary shade structures inside the mosque

Fabric and lights added to structures during annual Urs celebrations
Sikawar community move to the area and start worship around existing peepul tree.

Second temple built with shrine to goddess Durgah.

Population increases, people start to build more houses.

As population increases, and more people start to build houses in the area, the residents build a wall around it's walls to stop encroachment on the site so that it can continue to be used for collective events and festivities.

Comparison of Maintenance: Sikawar Temple
Worship continues within the temple (and tree remains important as part of this)

Marble floors and ornament continue to be incrementally added to and adjusted

Surrounding wells drop and water tank is installed and maintained by the temple community

Cyclical and temporary adjustments

Community platform is rarely used now that the panchayat has been replaced

Population continues to increase, people continue to build more houses and extend existing.

Marble floors and ornament continue to be incrementally added to and adjusted

Water tank continues to be maintained by the temple committee

2000 - 2014

Comparison of Maintenance: Sikawar Temple
Inter-Basti Civic Settings

1. Main Roads (Fatehabad Road and Taj Entrance Road)

2. Primary bazaar streets

3. Secondary bazaar streets (too many to name or label: Poule Mandi Street used as example)
The Main roads were built in the 19th century when Agra was under British government; at this time maps show the roads to be tree-lined with fields either side. As part of the 1975 masterplan, the construction of hotels, malls and shops was encouraged to create a place that could serve Taj Mahal tourists.

Research exercises that took place along the Main Road:
A. Marble Carving Demonstration, Souvenir Emporium  p 36
B. Birthday Party, Kentucky Fried Chicken Fast Food Store  p 38
2. Large non-residential plots (therefore places for discussion are not overlooked by families, friends - lending anonymity)

3. No shade on the road, and bad or no paving - not a place for spending time/discussions. Used for parking.

4. Wide road - discussions are not overlooked, lending anonymity, fast traffic makes people wandering between the two sides or spending time at the roadside because of the noise and dust.

5. Flat road - large construction so basements can be afforded too.

6. Part of the network of roads most used by tourists - so used by a lot of one-time visitors (affects opportunity to encounter difference through the creation of a space where people can be anonymous).

Inter-Basti Civic Settings **Main Road:** Communicative Order

Factors affecting intensity of use:

1. Buildings open to road, with backs to the bastis behind (shuts off view of and access to bastis)
2. Large non-residential plots (therefore places for discussion are not overlooked by families, friends - lending anonymity)
3. No shade on the road, and bad or no paving - not a place for spending time/discussions. Used for parking.
4. Wide road - discussions are not overlooked, lending anonymity, fast traffic makes people wandering between the two sides or spending time at the roadside because of the noise and dust.
5. Flat road - large construction so basements can be afforded too.
6. Part of the network of roads most used by tourists - so used by a lot of one-time visitors (affects opportunity to encounter difference through the creation of a space where people can be anonymous).
Large non-residential plots (therefore places for discussion are not overlooked by families, friends - lending anonymity)

Glass facades - allows views of products from vehicle, and one-time visitors more likely to enter (tourists)

Part of the network of roads most used by tourists - so used by a lot of one-time visitors (rather than being part of residents’ everyday routine)

Flat road - large construction so basements can be afforded too

Buildings open to road, with backs to bastis behind (shuts off view of and access to bastis)

Threshold - can be guarded, not a place for spending time/discussion

Deep plan - concrete frame with large open spans - creates space for ‘bursts’ of coach tours.

Small enclosed demonstration area for direct communication

Mughal shapes and motifs (especially Taj Mahal motifs)

‘Opulent’ decorations - sparkling lights, glass cases, red carpets, marble surfaces, carved joinery, soft seats

No shade on the road, and bad or no paving - not a place for spending time/discussions. Used for parking.

Wide road - discussions are not overlooked, lending anonymity, fast traffic stops people wandering between the two sides or spending time at the roadside because of the noise and dust

Factors affect intensity of use / anonymity

Factors affect opportunity for contest

Metaphoric depth - communication across time

Embodiment

Topography

Articulation

Factors affect intensity of use / anonymity

Main Road Conversation A: Communicative Order

Marble carving and inlay products, made inside the Tajganj bastis studied, (see description of basti interiors), are for the most part sold on the main roads. The products are sold in souvenir stalls, and larger ‘show-room’ stores, and sometimes these show-rooms have a live display workshop where many Tajganj residents work on commission. Otherwise, the showrooms and stalls make orders with Tajganj workshops through intermediaries called ‘thekedars’ (middlemen).
In this example, the display workshop is in the ground floor entrance. Visitors are asked to sit on the surrounding benches in a carefully orchestrated performance which, in my experience, makes most people feel obliged to buy something.

In this example, the display workshop is in the ground floor entrance. Visitors are asked to sit on the surrounding benches in a carefully orchestrated performance which, in my experience, makes most people feel obliged to buy something.

The glassy facades mean that one-time visitors such as tourists are more likely to enter, as they see inside as they pass.

The store is set back from the road enough to allow parking at the front. A taxi, autorickshaw driver or tourism agency (coach tour) will offer revenue payment from the store for bringing in tourists.

Opportunity to Encounter Difference

Opportunity to Negotiate Urban Conditions

Metaphoric Depth

- Sparkling light; glass cases, red carpets, marble surfaces, carved joinery, soft seats
- Mughal shapes and motifs (especially Taj Mahal motifs)
- Signs and posters
- Threshold - can be guarded, not a place for spending time/discussion

Main Road Conversation A: Civic Possibilities
Large non-residential plots (therefore places for discussion are not overlooked by families, friends - lending anonymity)

Glass facades - allows views from vehicles, one-time visitors more likely to enter (tourists) = anonymity

Part of the network of roads most used by tourists - so used by a lot of one-time visitors (rather than being part of residents’ everyday routine)

Flat road - large construction so basements can be afforded too

Buildings open to road, with backs to the bastis behind (shuts off view of and access to bastis)

Door threshold - not a place for spending time/discussion

Deep plan - concrete frame with large open spans - creates space for variety of uses (building owner rents out units)

Western-global decoration: plastic or chrome furniture, light colours / brand colours

No shade on the road, and bad or no paving - not a place for spending time/discussions, used for parking.

Wide road - discussions are not overlooked, lending anonymity, fast traffic stops people wandering between the two sides or spending time at the roadside because of the noise and dust

Factors affect opportunity for contest

Factor affects intensity of use / anonymity

Metallic depth - communication across time

Embodiment

Topography

Factor affects opportunity for contest

Metaphoric depth

- communication across time

1. Logos
2. Inspirational mantras, posters
3. Western-global decoration: plastic or chrome furniture, light colours / brand colours
4. Door threshold - not a place for spending time/discussion
5. Glass facades - allows views from vehicles, one-time visitors more likely to enter (tourists) = anonymity
6. Deep plan - concrete frame with large open spans - creates space for variety of uses (building owner rents out units)

Main Road Conversation B: Communicative Order
Opportunity to Encounter Difference

Unlike the emporiums, the entrance of the fast food stores is not guarded: anybody who can buy a soft drink is welcome - difference can be encountered, and tourists from various parts of the world share the space with people from all over the city and Tajganj residents. In certain cases, such as Sheroes Hangout, a cafe to raise money, support and awareness for the survivors of acid attacks, this opportunity has been harnessed to gain a political platform.

Opportunity to Negotiate Urban Conditions

With glassy facades just like the souvenir emporiums, the fast food cafes are visually connected with the internationally shared main road territory. However, the road is so wide, occupied by so many visitors, each side masked from the other by the fast traffic in-between, that one does not feel watched over when occupying these spaces, and can enjoy a great degree of anonymity.

Metaphoric Depth of Urban Negotiation

1. Logos
2. Inspirational mantras, posters
3. Western-global decoration: plastic or chrome furniture, light colours / brand colours

Main Road Conversation B: Civic Possibilities
Research exercises that took place along the Primary Bazaar Street:

A. Informal Interview, Chai Store  p 42
B. Committee Meeting, Lodi Temple  p 44
C. Committee Meeting, Madrasa  p 46
D. Buying Materials, Hardware Store  p 48
E. Informal Interviews, Houses  p 50

The primary bazaar street leads to the South entrance of the Taj Mahal from the east of the city; at the end nearer to the Taj, this bazaar would have been the busy heart of Mumtazabad, during the late Mughal period, with merchants trading goods from across the globe. Merchants built houses along this route as they became wealthy (Peck, 2011).

Inter-basti Civic Settings: 2. Primary Bazaar Street
Articulation

residential use/ mixed live-work
street overlooked by families = lack of anonymity

3.2. bazaar runs between hills, allowing multiple levels of external spaces / differentiated 'shared space'

Factors affect intensity of use

Embodiment

Topography

5. Locally practiced route to the Taj Mahal = used by the same people often = familiarity/lack of anonymity

small plots along the road = high number of thresholds = lively

residential use/ mixed live-work = street overlooked by families = lack of anonymity
In Fieldtrip One, many owners of houses labeled "heritage houses" by CURE were uncomfortable being interviewed within their homes. Instead, the first group meeting with owners of these houses took place on the bazaar street in the chai store. The chai store, often used for the committee meetings of the Kabristan (graveyard) committee, is a small place open to the street.

The chai store occupies a busy spot on the street corner, getting trade from both the bazaar street and the Kabristan street. It is extremely visible from both streets. However, the store itself can only contain a small number of guests at any time, who sit on the platform at the front, so it is both a very familiar gathering, and a very public one.

Primary Bazaar Street Conversation A Chai Store: Communicative Order

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor affects intensity of use</th>
<th>1. Regular painting and cleaning = respectful to guests</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Factor affects opportunity for contest</td>
<td>2. Shaded: allows long conversations; the threshold is the place for negotiation, rather than the shop interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor affects opportunity for contest</td>
<td>3. Entrance step: guests must be welcomed across it (part of the manners of negotiation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor affects opportunity for contest</td>
<td>4. Small platform for seated guests: creates intimacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor affects opportunity for contest</td>
<td>5. Residential entrances at the back of the buildings, shop entrances at the front (create two different kinds of spatial sharing)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor affects opportunity for contest</td>
<td>6. Corner position gives view of both the Shahi Mosque and Kabristan Mosque and long views of the bazaar street and kabristan path</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Metaphoric depth - communication across time

Embodiment

Topography

Articulation

Corner position gives view of both the Shahi Mosque and Kabristan Mosque and long views of the bazaar street and Kabristan path.
Visible position, easily found: views from Chai Store down bazaar street to the Shahi Masjid, and to the Kabristan Masjid.

On the outside edge of the basti, far away from even the entrances to privately owned homes, meeting attendees are given a degree of temporary equality (nobody except the chai wallah is in charge of hospitality, nobody’s personal belongings are visible) and in full view of the rest of the street, any untoward behavior would be quickly quashed.

The conditions of the chai store are maintained so as to be able to control numbers and levels of visibility / participation.

Metaphoric Depth of Urban Negotiation

Opportunity to Encounter Difference

Opportunity to Negotiate Urban Conditions

Primary Bazaar Street Conversation A: Civic Possibilities
The Lodi Temple site is mainly a temple garden scattered with shrines dating from at least 500 years ago to the present. However, at the far end of the gardens is the temple itself, used during the day as a place for traders to buy and sell jasmine (making money for the temple’s upkeep). This activity is overseen by the Lodi Temple Committee (see p24) and many of the committee members are neighbouring store-keepers.

Factors affect opportunity for contest:
1. particular murtis and shrines articulate the sacredness of particular trees
2. ghunta - bells
3. trabeate structure understood as Hindu, and of Lodi era; dome with octagonal drum - understood as proof that site has long been used for Hindu worship
4. tiles painted with deities
5. painted symbols
6. site is gardened - shows that site is cared for
7. regular painting
8. small shrines ensure solitary worship
9. sandstone flooring in front of shrines - allows barefoot worship (respect)
10. lights
11. trees provide shade - makes long conversations possible
12. slight elevation from road so that committee can watch over the bazaar street and people entering the meeting place) - also allows committee members to stay for longer as they can watch over their shops
13. water tap - drawn residents on a daily basis

Factors affect intensity of use / anonymity:
- small plots along the road = high number of thresholds = lively
- residential user mixed-low-work = street overwatched by familiarity = lack of anonymity
- narrow street - discussions are overlooked, slow traffic allows people to wander between sides and speed line is the street = lack of anonymity
- bazaar runs between hills, allowing multiple tiers of external spaces / differentiated shared space

Locally practiced route to the Taj Mahal = used by the same people often = familiarity/lack of anonymity

The Lodi Temple site is mainly a temple garden scattered with shrines dating from at least 500 years ago to the present. However, at the far end of the gardens is the temple itself, used during the day as a place for traders to buy and sell jasmine (making money for the temple’s upkeep). This activity is overseen by the Lodi Temple Committee (see p24) and many of the committee members are neighbouring store-keepers.
Conversation B. Opportunity to encounter difference: located along Primary Bazaar Street, visible to passers-by and location known by other committees who meet along the same street.

Primary Bazaar Street Conversation B: Civic Possibilities
The mosque committee meets on Friday after namaz (prayer) in the shaded verandah of the madrasa (empty on Fridays).
The verandah has a view of the bazaar street but is removed from it due to its higher level and step back, unlike the temple committee meeting point. Easily accessible, the mosque committee meetings can take place in the nearby plot to the Lodi Temple Committee without being too visible or audible: however, the presence of both on the street is clear, and they both look out over the street activity.

The meeting point neighbours other committee meeting points along the bazaar street, such as the Lodi temple meeting point - this allows urban discussions to take place at a larger scale, if necessary.

The madrasa is largely simply decorated, and subservient in message to the mosque next to it. The gate however that advertises the location of the madrasa to the bazaar street, is highly decorated - not in the Mughal tradition like the mosque, but with tiles and colourful calligraphy. This does not communicate the presence of a historic 'monument', but a significant working building: the pointed arch and calligraphy indicate Muslim faith.

Primary Bazaar Street Conversation C: Civic Possibilities
The hardware store sells and rents out tools, construction materials, and bamboo scaffolding.

Primary Bazaar Street Conversation D Hardware Store: Communicative Order

1. Shaded bench seating at threshold - many people can join the negotiation, it is not behind closed doors
2. Easy vehicular access from several routes through Tajganj (enables goods delivery)
3. Set back from road to allow delivery, pick-up, and also informal recycling and materials collection
4. Small plots along the road = high number of thresholds = lively
5. Signs and adverts in residential use / mixed live-work = street overlooked by families = lack of anonymity

Factors affect intensity of use / anonymity

1. Signs and adverts
2. Shaded bench seating at threshold - many people can join the negotiation, it is not behind closed doors
3. Easy vehicular access from several routes through Tajganj (enables goods delivery)
4. Set back from road to allow delivery, pick-up, and also informal recycling and materials collection
5. Small plots along the road = high number of thresholds = lively
6. Residential use / mixed live-work = street overlooked by families = lack of anonymity

Factors affect opportunity for contest

1. Signs and adverts
2. Shaded bench seating at threshold - many people can join the negotiation, it is not behind closed doors
3. Easy vehicular access from several routes through Tajganj (enables goods delivery)
4. Set back from road to allow delivery, pick-up, and also informal recycling and materials collection
5. Small plots along the road = high number of thresholds = lively
6. Residential use / mixed live-work = street overlooked by families = lack of anonymity

Factors affect metaphoric depth - communication across time

1. Signs and adverts
2. Shaded bench seating at threshold - many people can join the negotiation, it is not behind closed doors
3. Easy vehicular access from several routes through Tajganj (enables goods delivery)
4. Set back from road to allow delivery, pick-up, and also informal recycling and materials collection
5. Small plots along the road = high number of thresholds = lively
6. Residential use / mixed live-work = street overlooked by families = lack of anonymity

Articulate

Topography

Embodiment
Set back from the road slightly to allow small trucks to deliver heavy goods, creating a delivery and collection point, and because of this, a busy bargaining point.

Easy vehicular access at the crossing of several routes through Tajganj (enables goods delivery)

Next to the store, a small plot in front of a wall accommodates a man and a large set of scales, buying and selling recycled plastic. In front of the plot on the street itself is a pile of waste plastic that he is sorting through. Although this seems like an opportunistic and temporary stall, the framework of the scales is set in a concrete plinth in the plot. There are many of these seemingly vacant plots along the bazaar street that on closer inspection are used for the trading of low cost materials, essential to the smooth running of life behind the street (in an area with minimal waste collection, points for recycling materials are really important).

Plots along bazaar street level 00 that are used for low-income generating, but useful activities

Plots used for storing materials as well as sorting materials for recycling

Next to the store, a small plot in front of a wall accommodates a man and a large set of scales, buying and selling recycled plastic. In front of the plot on the street itself is a pile of waste plastic that he is sorting through. Although this seems like an opportunistic and temporary stall, the framework of the scales is set in a concrete plinth in the plot. There are many of these seemingly vacant plots along the bazaar street that on closer inspection are used for the trading of low cost materials, essential to the smooth running of life behind the street (in an area with minimal waste collection, points for recycling materials are really important).

Conversation D. Opportunity to encounter difference

Conversation D. Opportunity to negotiate urban conditions: flexible street edge made possible through resident committee, and resident ownership of plots along street

Primary Bazaar Street Conversation D: Civic Possibilities
Opportunity to encounter difference. Differentiated space

From the gate, there are a series of places that get increasingly private to the family as one gets deeper into the plan.

Differentiated space: comparison

The colonial homes in Bilochpura take elements from the earlier courtyard haveli houses of the Mughal era, and elements of the bungalows found in parts of the city developed by the British colonials. Mughal Haveli (Prasad, 1988)

Colonial-era home in Bilochpura (with recent additional structure)

Colonial-era bungalow, Agra

The ground floor of the colonial-era house to the left is no longer inhabitable, due to damp conditions caused by the raising of the road outside it, and the drain constructed along its wall.

While the courtyard wall only has one opening, the gate, the first floor of the house often has large door-size shuttered openings and large shuttered windows for a much greater level of communication with the street. These facades are highly decorated with a mixture of European neo-classical, Mughal and Indo-Arabic: a sign of the original owner embracing the British rulers’ eclectic tastes (most of the original owners of these houses worked for the British civil service). Highly decorated externally, these mansions were built to impress visitors and to add to the impressiveness of the neighbourhood as a whole.

Metaphoric depth of urban negotiation: Combined Cultures

Metaphoric depth - communication across time

Factors affect intensity of use / anonymity

Opportunity to negotiate urban conditions: response to changing context

Factors affect opportunity for contest

Many colonial-era homes in the area have been extended upwards to negotiate extra space in conditions where land is increasingly rare to get hold of.

While the courtyard wall only has one opening, the gate, the first floor of the house often has large door-size shuttered openings and large shuttered windows for a much greater level of communication with the street. These facades are highly decorated with a mixture of European neo-classical, Mughal and Indo-Arabic: a sign of the original owner embracing the British rulers’ eclectic tastes (most of the original owners of these houses worked for the British civil service). Highly decorated externally, these mansions were built to impress visitors and to add to the impressiveness of the neighbourhood as a whole.

Primary Bazaar Street Conversation E1: Communicative Order and Civic Possibilities
Locally practiced route to the Taj Mahal = used by the same people often = familiarity/lack of anonymity. Small plots along the road = high number of thresholds = lively. Shaded balconies and thresholds with large step allow people to spend time on the street edge = lively streets.

Most buildings along the street built in the last 20 years are residential at first floor level and above, and the residential floors have small openings masked by brightly coloured ballustrades, or brick screens. At street level, doors are accessed by large, roller-shuttered openings. There may also be several large advertisement boards.

Exchange can happen in several places: the threshold step (usually a stone or concrete step formed over the open street drain) for regular purchases; the stair platforms to the store for purchases that take more than a few minutes to carry out; inside the home (in the case of jewellery and clothing), for women's privacy, or for particularly complex bargaining from the balcony, where people converse with others on the road or other balconies, or in the shop, where people converse with people.

Most buildings along the street built in the last 20 years are residential at first floor level and above, and the residential floors have small openings masked by brightly coloured ballustrades, or brick screens. At street level, shops are accessed by large, roller-shuttered openings. There may also be several large advertisement boards.

The Mosque and Jami Temple committees have a lot of control over the stretches of bazaar street studied, as the architecture is negotiated through the committees. There are rules which are difficult to challenge for this reason, (it would be almost impossible to open a meat stall near the temple), however within these rules there is a great degree of freedom to articulate the architecture in the way that one wishes, as long as one can negotiate it with one's neighbours. Therefore, the street elevations are bright, clashing, and decorative. There are visual clues as to the negotiations that have taken place between neighbours, such as the way boundary walls are adjusted, windows blocked up, or balconies overlapping.

Exchange can happen in several places: the threshold step (usually a stone or concrete step formed over the open street drain) for regular purchases; the stair platforms to the store for purchases that take more than a few minutes to carry out; inside the home (in the case of jewellery and clothing), for women's privacy, or for particularly complex bargaining from the balcony, where people converse with others on the road or other balconies, or in the shop, where people converse with people.

Most buildings along the street built in the last 20 years are residential at first floor level and above, and the residential floors have small openings masked by brightly coloured ballustrades, or brick screens. At street level, shops are accessed by large, roller-shuttered openings. There may also be several large advertisement boards.
Maps show that the majority of Poule Mandi Street was formed as the garden around the Tomb of Diwani Begum was filled in with housing - residents' photographs show that in the 1980s a lot of these buildings were still 'kacha' (single storey mud buildings): since then, they have been replaced with brick houses occupying long, narrow plots along streets that run north to south, intersected by Poule Mandi Street.

It is in this post-colonial part of the street that the Poule Mandi (flower market) thrives in 2014. This is the part of the street that is shared between residents of Diwanji ka Mohalla, and residents of other bastis and parts of the city.

The residential use of the buildings along this street create the demand for the flower market between 2012 and 2014 in the same way that the market on the primary bazaar street caused houses to grow along it.

Adjacent ASI Prohibited Zone used by many people for rubbish dumping / defecation / gambling / sports means that the Poule Mandi Street (new side) is usually busy, with many unfamiliar faces - making it difficult for anybody to control behaviour there / the occupants do not commit to particular behaviours there (including maintenance)

Research exercises that took place along the Secondary Bazaar Street:

A. Women’s Craft Workshops, East Poule Mandi Street  p 53
B. Furniture Making Workshops, East Poule Mandi Street  p 55

Inter-Basti Civic Settings: 3. Secondary Bazaar Street
The residential use of the buildings along this street met the demand for the flower market between them (a large proportion of the residents are involved in flower trading). The houses were built before the market started taking place, as opposed to the primary bazaar street which caused houses to grow along it.

There are many different kinds of sharing taking place along Poule Mandi Street. The temple itself is maintained by surrounding residents who pay a fee, managed by the temple committee, and this covers theusage of a caretaker. The raised platform opposite is increasingly rented from the temple committee by farmers selling flowers. Increasingly, private open plots along the street are rented out by their owners to these farmers instead, the only architecture necessary being a shade structure, usually corrugated aluminum. There are usually enough farmers at the early morning flower market for all of these plots to get business. However, on slow days, a mixture of competitive pricing and built up loyalty determine the market site. This is only possible because there is enough open plot space for the farmers to park their bicycles, and the street is wide enough for them to cycle up to the market with large bundles of flowers. The ASI site, described later, is occasionally used as a market spill-over site, and otherwise used in a variety of informal ways. Some empty plots are used either individually or through a collective agreement for keeping cattles, and others have been converted into make-shift industrial space, also described later. In the afternoons, the shaded plots are also rented out to other vendors, such as a women who grinds coriander seeds.

The flower market can operate because most of the women in Diwan ji ka Mohalla earn money garlanding the flowers, and many of the families in the basti actually own flower shops and stalls. Therefore at the market, florists buy the flowers and pass them straight to the garlanders in their homes. They come back at the end of the day to collect the garlands. This has been the developing trade of the Kushwaha caste families in teh area, traditionally a caste involved in gardening. Therefore Poule Mandi Street doesn’t mediate between Diwan ji ka Mohalla and the neighbouring bastis, but rather between this basti and the rest of the city. This is an important ‘base’ for the Kushwaha caste, and therefore the flower market, the market of their caste trade, asserts their preferred role within the city.

A year after the furniture placing exercise, the ASI Prohibited Zone is again used by many people for rubbish dumping / defecation / gambling / sports which means that Poule Mandi Street (new side) is usually busy, with many unfamiliar faces - making it difficult for anybody to control behaviour there (the occupants do not commit to particular behaviours there (including maintenance).
The residential use of the buildings along this street create the demand for the flower market between them (a large proportion of the residents are involved in flower trading). The houses were built before the market started taking place, as opposed to the primary bazaar street which caused houses to grow along it.

- **Unshaded gate entrance to reception room** - not a place for spending time/negotiation
- **Greater variation of places for different kinds of guests** - rooftop an important place for women carrying out domestic activities who can talk to the women carrying out similar tasks on neighbouring rooftops
- **Articulate decoration** follows fashion - chrome, white marble, fresh paint - communicating health/wellbeing/lifestyle
- **Greater variation of places for different kinds of guests** - rooftop an important place for women carrying out domestic activities who can talk to the women carrying out similar tasks on neighbouring rooftops
- **Unshaded gate entrance to reception room** - not a place for spending time/negotiation
- **Greater variation of places for different kinds of guests** - rooftop an important place for women carrying out domestic activities who can talk to the women carrying out similar tasks on neighbouring rooftops

### Secondary Bazaar Street Conversation: A Women's Craft Workshop

**Communicative Order**

1. Religious stickers/tiles
2. Articulate decoration follows fashion - chrome, white marble, fresh paint - communicating health/wellbeing/lifestyle
3. Greater variation of places for different kinds of guests - rooftop an important place for women carrying out domestic activities who can talk to the women carrying out similar tasks on neighbouring rooftops
4. Unshaded gate entrance to reception room - not a place for spending time/negotiation
5. The residential use of the buildings along this street create the demand for the flower market between them (a large proportion of the residents are involved in flower trading). The houses were built before the market started taking place, as opposed to the primary bazaar street which caused houses to grow along it
6. Adjacent ASI Prohibited Zone used by many people for rubbish dumping / gambling / sports means that the Poule Mandi Street (new side) is usually busy, with many unfamiliar faces - making it difficult for anybody to control behaviour there / the occupants do not commit to particular behaviours there (including maintenance)
1. Opportunity to Encounter Difference

Metaphoric depth of urban negotiation: a mixture of religious belief, superstitions, fashion and personal interests.

Although new construction is not allowed close to the ASI protected monument Tomb of Diwani Begam, this house has several recent additions, unlike the adjoining properties, which are not even painted. This may be due to a personal friendship between the relatively wealthy family and somebody with political influence, or it may be due to bribery. Either way, it is very difficult in this part of the street to negotiate urban conditions in order to live in the manner one wishes to without breaking the law.

Secondary Bazaar Street Conversation A: Civic Possibilities
Although the openness of the plot might be perceived to increase the opportunities to encounter difference in the setting, it has the opposite effect for the women who live in the house. They stay away from the edges of the site because interaction with the street is less controlled — many unfamiliar people can see directly into the yard. Where the buildings are more established and less threatened by the DSM in the colonial-era part of the street, they more tightly embody the ways in which people wish to live and work. In the newer part of Poule Mandi Street, the residents’ activities have to be much more responsive to the conditions which are not easily altered. This has resulted in an order without the shades of exclusivity of the houses on the bazaar street, without the same choice of exchange, especially for women.

Secondary Bazaar Street Conversation B Furniture Making Workshop: Communicative Order
Opportunity to Negotiate Urban Conditions

Inability to commit to long-term development, lack of privacy to participate: The majority of houses in this area are not even painted. It is very difficult in this part of the street to negotiate urban conditions in order to live in the manner one wishes to without breaking the law, because construction under the ASI AMASR Act is forbidden (unless planning permission is granted), but this would be extremely rare – see A6.

Metaphoric Depth

Short-lasting commitments to communication

Secondary Bazaar Street Conversation B: Civic Possibilities
Rallies, though considered ‘intangible’ heritage (ref) are shaped by the inherited, historical urban form.

Civic Opportunity Between Bastis: Organised Rallies / Processions
Residents are able to organise across bastis in order to practice valued rituals and festivals, but there is no such organisational structure for maintenance of Tajganj-scale infrastructures such as the Taj East Drain.

Pigeon fancying and kite flying festivals are widely participated in in Tajganj by both Hindus and Muslims. There are two ways to participate: the first is to gather at the river Yamuna, in the flood plain in front of the Red Fort; there is a large pigeon festival in this location on the 25th December. The second is to participate from the rooftop of one’s own home; most Tajganj residents do this. This allows visual connection and communication between participants while avoiding strangers and potential violence. The pigeon fancying festivals involve large amounts of betting which can, I was told, lead to fighting. For this reason, papers are filled out months in advance to request police presence in Tajganj during such events. Whole families can participate in these enormous rooftop events.

Civic Opportunity Between Bastis: Organised Festivals vs. ‘Infrastructure’ Taken for Granted
Research exercises that took place within the bastis:

A. Storytelling Exercise, Mosque Chowk, Bilochpura  
B. Storytelling Exercise, Temple Chowk, Diwanji ka Mohalla  
C. Residential Street Comparison: Diwanji ka Mohalla (storytelling)/  
    Sikawar Basti (sign-making workshop)/  
D. Industrial Street Comparison: Bilochpura (sign-making workshop)/  
    Diwanji ka Mohalla (transect walk)  
E. Well Restoration Workshop, Temple Garden, Nagar Ganj  
F. Storytelling Exercise, ASI Prohibited Zone, Diwanji ka Mohalla

Interior-Basti Civic Settings
Most of the facades on the chowk have very small openings for ventilation and letting in small amounts of light rather than to create views between house and chowk. A lot of them have no open walls as a gate, as they are courtyard walls. The courtyard gate is often marked by an exaggerated archway in stone, decorated with geometric patterns and calligraphy, and the courtyard gate is often the setting for temporary art. catholic(

The colonial-era facades are highly decorative, using geometric patterns and calligraphy along with some non-classical language. Decorations are highly ornamented with less traditional plasterwork details, in comparison with the temple chowk. It is not windows and doorways that are celebrated but courtyards - the decoration is much more articulated but the facades almost entirely block the view into any part of the home. There is lots of temporary articulation in the form of painted artwork, beads, stickers, and posters than the temple chowk: personal expression of religious belief on the external walls of individual houses is not considered appropriate.

In the storytelling exercise, it was not considered appropriate to put paper scrolls on the walls of the central chowk for any period of time that lasts over into prayer time. However, when the stories were transferred onto tiles, and hand decorated by women from the basti, these plaques were allowed to be put up (although not too many). The plaques were considered a positive addition to the place, while paper was seen to be negative. This reveals a respected hierarchy of materials correlating with the importance of place, and perhaps an agreement that using lasting materials is a more appropriate way of expressing one's most important values.

The plaques were considered a positive addition to the place, while paper was seen to be negative. This reveals a respected hierarchy of materials correlating with the importance of place, and perhaps an agreement that using lasting materials is a more appropriate way of expressing one's most important values.
Unlike the temple chowk, purposefully positioned at the intersection of several inner-basti streets, there are very few entrances into the mosque chowk: only narrow steep stairs or ramps. However, like the temple chowk opposite, the elevated set back position of this chowk creates a peaceful place separate from the main bazaar through which strangers from outside the basti don’t tend to pass, so behavior can be more tightly controlled.
Opportunity to negotiate urban conditions: commitment to decorum specified by committee leaders

Different settings around the chowk were found to be considered appropriate for different activities during the storytelling exercise. Preparations took place at the madrasa (for men) and in family courtyards (for women). The central chowk was not considered appropriate for exhibiting the majority of the stories at all - the exhibition could only take place in the streets in the sides of the chowk. The residents and users of this shared space commit to tightly specified appropriate ways of sharing ultimately decided by committee.

Amplifying the feeling that one should behave appropriately in the chowk is the fact that the Maulvi’s house looks directly onto the chowk so that people feel under surveillance, and that there will be immediate consequences if they behave inappropriately. Most of the facades on the chowk have very small openings for ventilation and letting in small amounts of light rather than to create views between house and chowk. A lot of them have no openings except a gate, as they are courtyard walls.

Interior-Basti Civic Settings *Mosque Chowk*: Civic Possibilities
Topography

The Chowk is at the crossing between the market street and the historical edge of the tomb garden - people constantly pass through, mainly from the basti or the market.

Facades have large openings and deep shaded facades with steps for sitting, spending time, negotiation. Mourning rituals took place at this threshold during storytelling exercise.

Temple committee collect money for maintenance and cleaning of the Chowk - at ground floor buildings are kept freshly plastered and painted.

Raised platform faces temple - in view of the temple caretaker. Raised to avoid rain, cows, and vehicles, the platform also marks a clear boundary for renting market space. Worship is physically separated from post-mortem activities of the temple committee, but they are visibly linked. When necessary, the platform becomes a theatre stage and the Chowk at lower level becomes audience space. Sightlines from the Chowk down to the primary basti streets to which it connects allows somebody in the Chowk, for example the temple committee, to quickly call people together by shouting down the streets.

European-classical ornament of the surrounding British colonial era buildings does not take Mughal motifs and shapes - the arches here are semi-circular, and this is not a courtyard 'haveli' house - it does not communicate Islamic heritage.

Newer additions to buildings (post 100m) are cheap brick construction without articulation, or large openings - do not create places for discussions.

With the decoration and symbolism given to the temple itself, the platform remaining undecorated.

European-classical ornament of the surrounding British colonial era buildings does not take Mughal motifs and shapes - the arches here are semi-circular, and this is not a courtyard 'haveli' house - it does not communicate Islamic heritage.

Newer additions to buildings (post 100m) are cheap brick construction without articulation, or large openings - do not create places for discussions.

With the decoration and symbolism given to the temple itself, the platform remaining undecorated.

Temple committee collect money for maintenance and cleaning of the Chowk - at ground floor buildings are kept freshly plastered and painted.

Raised platform faces temple - in view of the temple caretaker. Raised to avoid rain, cows, and vehicles, the platform also marks a clear boundary for renting market space. Worship is physically separated from post-mortem activities of the temple committee, but they are visibly linked. When necessary, the platform becomes a theatre stage and the Chowk at lower level becomes audience space. Sightlines from the Chowk down to the primary basti streets to which it connects allows somebody in the Chowk, for example the temple committee, to quickly call people together by shouting down the streets.

Interior-Basti Civic Settings Temple Chowk: Communicative Order

Metaphoric Depth of the Urban Negotiation

Around the Chowk is a mixture of colonial-era and more recent buildings, in their first stage built as single-story small dwellings. This part of the facade has large openings, grilled, a step designed to look out and feel like part of the street. The colonial facades are highly decorative with a pattern of semi-circular arch recesses inside rectangular recesses around each window and door. These houses have shed Mughal style in favour of a much more European colonial design, because this is a Hindu area. The new houses are decorated with colour, and decorative metalwork in the window grates and balustrades. Many of the buildings then have several additional bare brick storeys without overhangs, large openings or plaster. This cheap construction is added to slowly in case it is ordered to come down, as it is done without planning permission from the ASI.

Articulate

Facade have large openings and deep shaded facades with steps for sitting, spending time, negotiation. Mourning rituals took place at this threshold during storytelling exercise.

Temple committee collect money for maintenance and cleaning of the Chowk - at ground floor buildings are kept freshly plastered and painted.

Raised platform faces temple - in view of the temple caretaker. Raised to avoid rain, cows, and vehicles, the platform also marks a clear boundary for renting market space. Worship is physically separated from post-mortem activities of the temple committee, but they are visibly linked. When necessary, the platform becomes a theatre stage and the Chowk at lower level becomes audience space. Sightlines from the Chowk down to the primary basti streets to which it connects allows somebody in the Chowk, for example the temple committee, to quickly call people together by shouting down the streets.

Chowk is at crossing between the market street and historical edge of tomb garden - people constantly pass through, mainly from the basti or the market.

Factors affect intensity of use

Factors also affect opportunity for contest

Metaphoric depth communication across time

Interior-Basti Civic Settings Temple Chowk: Communicative Order
When women were mourning a deceased relative on the proposed day of the workshop, it had to be delayed: during this time people passing through the chowk were silent.

Intensity of use 6 months after the hosted event - chowk still overlooked by women flower garlanders: children use the seats as playground. It was found during the exercise that families living around the chowk can gather there quickly if there is an event going on - their constant occupation of thresholds allows a constant monitoring of activity there.

When women were no longer mourning, nobody opposed any aspect of the workshop: it met very little resistance. There is a certain degree of expected behaviour in the chowk in order for particular activities to be able to happen there at certain times, but the expectations of behaviour in Bichpura Mosque Chowk (next) have a greater degree of complexity, and are committed to everyday (although still have a cyclical element).

Interior-Basti Civic Settings

Temple Chowk: Civic Possibilities
Topography

Deep, shaded threshold with step for sitting and spending time - negotiations in the street, not behind closed doors.

Street facade has large openings on first and second floor level for inhabitants to sit and converse with people below.

European-classical ornament does not take Mughal motifs and shapes - the arches here are semi-circular, and this is not a courtyard 'haveli' house - it does not communicate Islamic heritage.

Permanent commitments from residents of these houses to worship at the Durga shrine in the chowk between them - daily redressing, painting and acting out the rituals as well as maintaining the small platform and shrine structure.

Painted symbols, tiles and stickers

Narrow street - discussions are overlooked, slow traffic allows people to wander between sides and spend time in the street a lack of anonymity.

This part of the street is not part of the primary route to and from the ASI zone, or the flower market, so there are not many strangers - very little anonymity - space in middle can be shared by women for worship of Durga (Hindu deity).

Articulate

Factors affect intensity of use

1. Permanent commitments from residents of these houses to worship at the Durga shrine in the chowk between them - daily redressing, painting and acting out the rituals as well as maintaining the small platform and shrine structure.

2. European-classical ornament does not take Mughal motifs and shapes - the arches here are semi-circular, and this is not a courtyard 'haveli' house - it does not communicate Islamic heritage.

3. Painted symbols, tiles and stickers

4. Like the newer houses on the street, the rooftop is an important place for women carrying out domestic activities who can talk to the women carrying out similar tasks on neighbouring rooftops.

5. Street facade has large openings on first and second floor level for inhabitants to sit and converse with people below.

6. Deep, shaded threshold with step for sitting and spending time - negotiations in the street, not behind closed doors.

7. Narrow street - discussions are overlooked, slow traffic allows people to wander between sides and spend time in the street a lack of anonymity.

8. This part of the street is not part of the primary route to and from the ASI zone, or the flower market, so there are not many strangers - very little anonymity - space in middle can be shared by women for worship of Durga (Hindu deity).

Factors also affect opportunity for contest

1. Permanent commitments from residents of these houses to worship at the Durga shrine in the chowk between them - daily redressing, painting and acting out the rituals as well as maintaining the small platform and shrine structure.

2. European-classical ornament does not take Mughal motifs and shapes - the arches here are semi-circular, and this is not a courtyard 'haveli' house - it does not communicate Islamic heritage.

3. Painted symbols, tiles and stickers

4. Like the newer houses on the street, the rooftop is an important place for women carrying out domestic activities who can talk to the women carrying out similar tasks on neighbouring rooftops.

5. Street facade has large openings on first and second floor level for inhabitants to sit and converse with people below.

6. Deep, shaded threshold with step for sitting and spending time - negotiations in the street, not behind closed doors.

7. Narrow street - discussions are overlooked, slow traffic allows people to wander between sides and spend time in the street a lack of anonymity.

8. This part of the street is not part of the primary route to and from the ASI zone, or the flower market, so there are not many strangers - very little anonymity - space in middle can be shared by women for worship of Durga (Hindu deity).
Opportunity to encounter difference - spatial differentiation

Interior-Basti Civic Settings *Residential Street A*: Civic Possibilities
Opportunity to negotiate urban conditions: privacy to participate

Because this part of the street is not used as a route to the flower market for traders, it is primarily only used by residents. Because of this degree of familiarity, accentuated by the way the constant occupation of house thresholds and balconies set up a constant surveillance of the chowk, women have committed to building a shrine to goddess Durgai, and perform daily worship around it.

Metaphoric Depth: long-term commitment to articulate faith

At the east side of Poule Mandi Street, where new construction is prohibited, short term methods such as etchings and paint are used to articulate particular beliefs upon architecture that is otherwise cheap and unexpressive. In contrast, here at the west side of Poule Mandi Street, carved stone, marble, ornate structural elements and metalwork have all been invested in to express faith, superstition as well as political leanings. For example through the classes of British colonial elements.

Interior-Basti Civic Settings Residential Street A: Civic Possibilities
Opportunity to encounter difference

There are not many balconies, there is no shade over thresholds, or large ground floor openings, which reflects the insular nature of the way homes are used – there is less trust: people have guard dogs and keep their front doors locked. This means that the streets are dirty and broken – socializing takes place around the entrance to the temple and the empty plot claimed by the temple opposite, while the streets remain quiet.
Like the second storeys and ‘sheds’ of the Diwanji area, the Sikawar houses are largely houses built as cheaply and quickly as possible. Then, after a certain confidence has been built (through negotiation, bribery, or just standing the test of time: usually all three additions are made). Firstly, a 1.5 storey block structure without overhangs, with cement floors, small openings is constructed in bare brick or painted bricks. The first floor is built at least 600 mm above street level to avoid floods, so there is a large threshold step. However, this is not shaded – it isn’t for sitting and spending time. Many of the houses are not connected to water or a toilet. Instead, a toilet might be shared between families. The temple is used by many for showering – and the inner courtyard is faced with intricate marble work: the interior in many ways looks like the 5* hotel bathrooms that the men work on in the day as much as it draws upon a tradition of temple (or palace) architecture.

Some houses have decoration on top of the brick construction: paint, tiles, decorative metal grates, largely following fashion, communicating wellbeing/lifestyle.

The few older buildings (colonial era) display sandstone carvings of deities - communicates long running practice of particular worship on the site.

Some of the families have now started making additions to their houses: one of the most developed forms of articulate upgrading are the individually designed marble and terrazzo floors of which the Sikawar craftsmen have become so practiced at making. The designs are a mixture of motifs learnt at work (often Mughal patterns because so many of the hotels have taken a Mughal interior theme), Hindu symbols, and experimentation.

Unsurprisingly then, the temple and a house next to it, which quite obviously predate Indian Independence due to their stone carving, are very important to the Sikawar residents. The stone carving is essential to their claim to the land they have built upon, being not just ‘old’ but also ‘theirs’ - most of the men in Sikawar work in the construction industry, mainly with marble tiling and stone facing. They are low paid manual labourers in their day job, but the work they put into the upkeep of their temple (p31) roots them in a tradition of skilled Sikawar craftsmen. The particular deities represented in the temple indicate particular Hindu practices that the Sikawar still uphold as the ‘descendants’ (if not exactly in blood then in caste) of the people who constructed this temple.

Some of the families have now started making additions to their houses: one of the most developed forms of articulate upgrading are the individually designed marble and terrazzo floors of which the Sikawar craftsmen have become so practiced at making. The designs are a mixture of motifs learnt at work (often Mughal patterns because so many of the hotels have taken a Mughal interior theme), Hindu symbols, and experimentation.
The industrial units fit into the order of the residential streets, as industrial use is not officially part of the Agra masterplan here. Working within the basti allows the workers to go to the mosque/temple easily, get home easily during lunch breaks, watch over their unit out of working hours, and control the days and hours that they work (e.g. in Bilochpura people mainly do not work on Friday).

The units are small (one or sometimes two rooms of domestic scale - max 5 metres) because they are always family-run businesses - at times of large orders, other spaces (neighbouring yards or rooms) are borrowed from friends, reducing financial risks. This also means that investment in the unit is kept minimal - no large spans.

Large steps over the drain at the front of the units allow interaction between the units and discussion about the work, materials, costs - shade above allows people to spend time at this discussion point at the threshold.

Streets wide enough for vehicles, but narrow enough to be overlooked - stops anonymity, allows groups to be involved in discussions, but larger deliveries and pick-ups are also possible, allowing small businesses to share larger wholesale orders.

Factors affect intensity of use and opportunity for contest:

1. Large steps over the drain at the front of the units allow interaction between the units and discussion about the work, materials, costs - shade above allows people to spend time at this discussion point at the threshold.
2. The units are small (one or sometimes two rooms of domestic scale - max 5 metres) because they are always family-run businesses - at times of large orders, other spaces (neighbouring yards or rooms) are borrowed from friends, reducing financial risks. This also means that investment in the unit is kept minimal - no large spans.
3. Streets wide enough for vehicles, but narrow enough to be overlooked - stops anonymity, allows groups to be involved in discussions, but larger deliveries and pick-ups are also possible, allowing small businesses to share larger wholesale orders.
4. The industrial units fit into the order of the residential streets, as industrial use is not officially part of the Agra masterplan here. Working within the basti allows the workers to go to the mosque/temple easily, get home easily during lunch breaks, watch over their unit out of working hours, and control the days and hours that they work (e.g. in Bilochpura people mainly do not work on Friday).

Interior-Basti Civic Settings Industrial Street A (Bilochpura): Communicative Order
The industrial units fit into the order of the residential streets, as industrial use is not officially part of the Agra masterplan here. Working within the basti allows the workers to go to the mosque/temple easily, get home easily during lunch breaks, watch over their unit out of working hours, and control the days and hours that they work (eg in Bilochpura people mainly do not work on Friday).

Along the plotted streets, there are many empty or abandoned plots, and many half empty plots, as further construction is prohibited under the AMASR Act. This provides opportunity for residents to use the sites for purposes that do not require construction considered 'permanent' or 'structural' by the ASI. Therefore, lean-to and shed structures have been built for small scale industry: glasswork, carpentry, metalwork.

Sheds sit behind unshaded gate entrance to yard – not a place for spending time/negotiation. Rooms inside the house are private for family – street not overlooked = no semi-public area for negotiation.

People do not spend time in the street between the units, so there is no investment in them: the resulting bad lighting, services, paving further decreases the opportunities for shared discussion or vehicular movement.

Narrow streets, unpaved, unlit - difficult for vehicular traffic, for unloading/pickup/collecting wholesale goods. Restricts these businesses from growing/gaining formality.

Factors affect intensity of use and opportunity for contact.

Interior-Basti Civic Settings Industrial Street B (Diwanji ka Mohalla): Communicative Order
In the village basti, small industrial units cluster together on larger, wider streets creating a space between them for discussion, encountering each other, as well as creating a place where they can collectively arrange pick-up and deliveries – tying them as a cluster into wider networks.

In the plot basti, because units are built often on dead-ended or very quiet residential streets, and often within shared off yard space, there is very little opportunity to converse with other tradesmen.

Due to their ability to cluster, and therefore bargain collectively, the industrial units in the village basti are better able to negotiate the conditions that they wish for. The industrial units in the plot basti are further hindered in this regard because they are forbidden, under the AMASR Act to construct adequate workspace. Clustering in the village basti also allows units to shrink or expand temporarily, renting space to and from neighbouring units.

Interior-Basti Civic Settings Industrial Street A + B: Civic Possibilities
Walled, gated site - watched over by priest (supported by worshipping constituents)

Painted symbols, stickers, tiles, home-made clay offerings

Pointed ‘Sikhara’ (roof) representing Mt. Kailash can be seen from the street, and further away, so that people understand this as a temple site

Body-sized shrines (around 2m cubed or less) allow private worship and soliary rituals

Stone or tiled floors around shrines for barefoot worship - respect. Fresh painting and maintenance - respect

Trees, and sometimes canopies, provide shade so that people can spend time in the garden

Surrounding houses do not have large windows overlooking the gardens - homes kept separate from the temple.

Murtis and their shrines articulate the sacred nature of particular trees

Water tap sustains the garden as a regular meeting point for residents

Factors affect intensity of use and opportunity for contest

Metaphoric Depth

1. Murtis and their shrines articulate the sacred nature of particular trees
2. Painted symbols, stickers, tiles, home-made clay offerings
3. Pointed ‘Sikhara’ (roof) representing Mt. Kailash can be seen from the street, and further away, so that people understand this as a temple site
4. Trees, and sometimes canopies, provide shade so that people can spend time in the garden
5. Stone or tiled floors around shrines for barefoot worship - respect. Fresh painting and maintenance - respect
6. Lights
7. Body-sized shrines (around 2m cubed or less) allow private worship and soliary rituals
8. Surrounding houses do not have large windows overlooking the gardens - homes kept separate
9. Water tap sustains the garden as a regular meeting point for residents
10. Gated site - watched over by priest (supported by worshipping constituents)

Interior-Basti Civic Settings Temple Garden: Communicative Order
The temple garden mediates between the busy bazaar street and the body-sized intimate worship space of the shrine: walled and gated, only those wishing to visit the temple enter the site. However, this exclusivity creates the conditions required by the priest and committee to hold meetings and make decisions. Temple gardens bear the signs of constantly renegotiated conditions, added to consistently, maintained and gardened daily.

Most of the profound articulation has very short temporal horizons: paint in the appropriate colour for the gods worshipped, offerings (flowers and food), clay lamps and figures, coloured powders, paper decorations. The more durable elements are there to make this ritualistic layering of meaning possible. It is the combination of these signs of ongoing cyclical ceremonial life and the more carefully put together (if aesthetically ad-hoc) platforms that tell people to behave in a certain way – or to leave the site alone. When there are historic pieces of architecture, they are regularly repainted, significant in so far as they are a further claim to a site unofficially owned, and also sometimes as a support to local legends.
This unbuilt area next to the assumed tomb of Diwani Begum is under the ‘100m rule’ of the AMASR Act. No construction is permitted, stopping long-term use of the site developing, or therefore resident-led maintenance. The site is large and next to the flower market - many people use it and it is not tightly overlooked = enables anonymous use, defecation, rubbish dumping, gambling, etc. Surrounding houses do not open onto the area with large windows, entrance thresholds etc. They ‘turn their backs’ to the area, with a few small openings, no decoration. Gated area directly around the tomb is usually locked, creating an unsupervised area, reducing the way that the site can be overlooked by residents - allowing even more anonymity in the site, especially in the gated area (for trespassers). Cheap construction built without permission - no decorations except stickers/some paint in case structures are ordered to be removed. Shape of tomb - pointed arches, octagonal, (originally domed) understood as Mughal tomb structure. However, all ornament has been stripped away.

Like the Shahi Masjid, decoration of the monument itself has been completely removed for basic ASI maintenance and to strip it down to its oldest materials. The fact that there is a historic Muslim figure buried in the tomb, and that the shape of it signifies in itself that this is a grand tomb means that there is a certain orientation to the Islamic moral direction towards death. However, while every other grave in the area is regularly covered in cloth, swept and decorated, this one remains bare.
The edge of the boundary of the Prohibited Zone is felt to be a negotiable area for placing furniture during the storytelling exercise.

Intensity of use 6 months after the storytelling event: the market continues to contribute participants, and several market traders have built a more permanent seat in place of the workshop-made seats, and trade under it. Trespassing, rubbish dumping, gambling are happening once more in the gated monument.

This site does provide a place for dissenting behaviours, but this quality has not been negotiated and is rather a side effect of blight. Without the opportunity for negotiation with neighbouring residents, the gamblers, rubbish dumpers, alcoholics are perceived as an unavoidable nuisance – there is no formal arena within which the situation can be addressed. A small incident can be inflammatory for this reason, and houses along the street concentrate on the exclusive space within them, and keeping it safe, rather than forms of sharing – as addressed earlier when examining the secondary bazaar street.

The fact that the prohibited zone is in effect is only a small portion of the actual prohibited zone (area within 100m of the tomb in all direction) shows how negotiable this boundary is.
Left: maps made in informal interviews, Fieldtrip 4, when residents were asked to identify “purani dharohar” (old legacy/heritage) after several workshops to redefine these words.

Right: further conversations took place when collaborators carried out walks to visit the identified heritage.

Heritage Transect Walks
AMAR protected monuments, and surrounding Prohibited Zones

Architectural heritage as noted by Peck, 2011

Architectural heritage featured in the Taj Heritage Walk

Buildings observed to be constructed in colonial period or before

Purani Dharohar (heritage) drawn by 36 resident groups during Field-trip four

Heritage Transect Walks: Comparison to alternative definitions of heritage value in Tajganj
Maps used to create Transect Walk 1

1. Temple well
2. Kabristan well
3. Kabristan
4. Grave
5. Kabristan Masjid well
6. Grave
7. Grave
8. Grave
9. Maulvi’s house
10. Gate, Bilochpura
11. Bilochpura Masjid
12. Steps, Bilochpura
13. Shahi masjid
14. Grave

Transect Walk One
Maps used to create Transect Walk 2

1. Rai family neighbourhood
2. Old tax collecting area
3. Rai family haveli
4. Rai family gardens
5. Bazaar Street well
6. Bazaar Street well
7. Brickmaker's hill
8. House, Bilochpura
9. House, Bilochpura
10. House, Bilochpura
11. Bilochpura Masjid
12. Kabristan, Nagar Ganj

Transect Walk Two
Maps used to create Transect Walk 3

1. Sikawar house
2. Carving, Sikawar
3. Sikawar temple
4. Sikawar House
5. Temple yard
6. Empty plot, Sikawar
7. Well, Dwaraka ka M.
8. Platforms
9. Durgah shrine
10. House
11. House
12. Flower garlanding
13. Glasswork
14. Metalwork
15. Pottery
16. Chainmaking
17. Lodi temple
18.-27. Kushwaha temple

Transect Walk Three
Bazaar streets were often mentioned in residents' memories of the past. Rather than separating neighbourhoods, these streets provide places for interaction and sharing between bastis: buying, selling, education, worship and ration collection are all activities that people from multiple bastis come together to participate in.

The hilly terrain of the area featured heavily in residents' stories about the past, in the way that certain activities would be separated from daily life by situating them on higher ground (such as slaughtering animals for meat).

Some residents drew boundaries around their basti while they were talking about the area's history. While the ADA slum boundaries usually run along physical features such as streets and canals, the resident-drawn boundaries were often drawn one row of houses back from these features.

On visiting the sites of resident-drawn boundary lines, it could be seen that the boundary is often a ‘seam’ where the houses run back to back, while houses that faced each other across streets generally consider themselves part of the same basti.

This means that the places directly outside residents’ homes are generally shared with members of the same basti, mediating the journey between home and places further away, where greater difference is encountered.
Research exercises that took place within the bastis:

A. Transect Walk, Shrine of Baba Maedum Shah Husein and Chishti Rahmatullah inside the Shahi Masjid p85
B. Craft Workshop, Sikawar Temple p87
C. Informal Interview, Maulvi’s House, Bilochpura p89
D. Storytelling Exercise, Temple Chowk, Diwanji ka Mohalla p91
E. Committee Meeting, Lodi Temple, Bazaar Street p92
F. Buksh Museum of Hobby craft, Buksh House, Bilochpura p93

Celebrated Civic Settings
Celebrated Civic Setting Conversation A: Temporal Communicative Order

1. hill
4. raised walled courtyard setting
2. graves
5. carved stone enclosure
3. carved gravestones
9. murals
7. terrazzo shrine floor
6. railings and turrets
10. fabric covers
11. plastering and concreting
8. light and electric
12. green paint
13. fairy lights
14. red prayer threads
15. flowers sweets

Articulation

carved gravestones
graves
raised walled courtyard setting
light and electric

 replaced every 1000 years
 replaced every 200 years
 replaced every 50 years
 replaced every 20 years
 replaced every 10 years
 replaced every 5 years
 replaced every year
 replaced every week
 replaced every day

never changed
Opportunity to encounter difference: daily use by specific group; removed from busy thoroughfares

Opportunity to negotiate urban conditions: negotiated maintenance; commitment to conditions that set up respectful gathering

Metaphoric Depth of Urban Negotiation

Replaced every 350 years
The oldest kind of ornament is carved stone. The gravestone is carved with calligraphy, while the structure’s openings are framed with carved columns of the ‘bulbous, “cypress-like”’ (Peck, 2011) style generally associated with the late Mughal (late 18th century to be more specific) period.

Replaced every 150 years
The structure is painted with gloss emulsion (believed to protect it, although it is actually quite damaging) – in other words, these are the materials that the committee commit to preserving for as long as possible.

Replaced every 20 years
The outside of the structure is tiled with locally bought tiles in a geometric pattern, which corresponds to ‘appropriate’ mosque design for the committee, but is modular and cheap so easily sourced and replaced.

Replaced every 15 years
The chrome grills take the idea of the Mughal jali screen carved out of stone but instead use a fashionable product within Tajganj that is less labour intensive, and, while that can be found locally in larger number, it is not made specifically for Muslims (although it is not surprising given the Mughal influence in the region). For the same reason, the turrets take an ornamental nod to minarets but make it out of metal.

Replaced every 3 years
On the inner walls are small murals, painted in the last decade, of the Kaaba and Masjid al Haram in Saudi Arabia reminding worshippers of their orientation to the prophet Muhammed, and below the paintings the graves themselves and cenotaphs above are laid with the head to the north – this is so that the body will face Mecca when it wakes on the day of judgement and turn on its side. For the same reason, bright green paint (colour associated with Islam) is applied regularly to the inner walls, and fabric covers and beads which are washed and replaced dress the gravestones. Marigolds, roses, sweets and grains decorate the graves during the Urs festivities – a ritual honouring (if not offering actually shared with the Hindus in Tajganj who use the same thing for puja – not surprising given the two religions have shared a city for over 500 years.)

Celebrated Civic Setting Conversation A: Civic Possibilities
Celebrated Civic Setting Conversation B: Temporal Communicative Order
Opportunity to encounter difference: daily use for resident showering, and puja

Opportunity to negotiate urban conditions: resident-committee maintained

Metaphoric depth of urban negotiation: siting current beliefs particular to the temple's occupants within wider Hindu culture

There are a number of other important elements in the Sikawar temple, including the ghantas (brass bells) hung in the garbagriha, (inner sanctum) and rung during puja, which have a design of the deity's avatar cast onto them. Then in the temporal order come window grates with further swastikas, and pale blue paint which is regularly reapplied.

On a weekly basis the murtis are cleaned and dressed. On a daily basis candles, flowers and sweets are used to decorate the garbagriha for puja.

There are some remaining stone carvings – the murti of Hanuman and the angels above the cusped entrance archway are particularly unusual because of their human likeness. There are also neo-classical column details in the entrance arch and inner cloisters. All of these carvings are of great importance to the committee and they have tried to prolong their lifespan with gloss paint. The old brick walls, on the other hand, are not so carefully maintained – they are not so significant, even though they are as old.

There are various attitudes towards sacred trees in Hindu India, including the belief that planting a tree will be rewarded in the next life. There are many claims that a lot of Hindu practices started with worship of the tree itself, and temples were built later to provide a place to worship the tree spirit (Ramayana, 1930). This is a story that I heard in Tajganj about the choice of location for temple building, due to the fact that many of the Mughal Tajganj settlements did not know whether they would stay in the area for very long, and so made their temporary place of worship an existing tree, around which a ‘tola’ (settlement) would develop. The tree in the Sikawar grounds is a betel tree, associated with the deity Hanuman in the Mahabharata. Given that the tree is located directly behind the shrine to Hanuman in the Sikawar temple, which forms the north-east corner of the temple and contains one of the oldest murtis (Hanuman) the temple might have actually been built there to provide the best met hodological conditions within which to carry out worship based upon the belief that the site has a sacred link to the divine.

Celebrated Civic Setting Conversation B: Civic Possibilities

Area where committee constituents reside
Committee meeting point
Area maintained by committee

Marble work
Arti
Arrange festivals
Look after open space outside
Animals graze in open space
Use for water and washing

Committee
All Residents

Sikawar Temple

Replaced every 30 years

Replaced every 200 years

Replaced every 15 years

Replaced every 10 years

Replaced every 5 years

Replaced weekly/daily

Replaced every 20 years

Replaced every 200 years

Replaced every 5 years

Replaced every 10 years
never

changed

replaced
every

1000 years

200 years

50 years

20 years

10 years

5 years

year

week

day

Articulation

1. hill

2. street pattern/ steps up hill

3. stone carved facade

4. copper heirlooms

5. building form and openings

6. carved timber doors and ceilings

7. wall divisions

8. light and electric

9. furniture

10. flooring

11. prayer mat

12. curtains, rug

13. plastering and concreting

14. planting

15. paint

Celebrated Civic Setting Conversation C: Temporal Communicative Order
Opportunity to encounter difference: Mediation of sharing from street, to chowk, to interior courtyard, to rooms.

Opportunity to negotiate urban conditions: adaptation for new use

Metaphoric Depth of urban negotiation

Celebrated Civic Setting

Conversation C: Civic Possibilities
Celebrated Civic Setting Conversation D: Temporal Communicative Order / Civic Possibilities

**Articulation**

1. Hill
2. Temple Structure
3. Colonial Facades
4. Panchayat Hall Space
5. Street Pattern/Crossing
6. Lingum
7. Murtis
8. Platform
9. Stone Steps
10. Threshold Steps and Facade Adjustments to Houses
11. Tiles
12. Light and Electric
13. Plastering and Concreting
14. Aluminium Roof
15. Shade Structures
16. Murti Dresses
17. Posters
18. Stickers
19. Flowers
20. Paint
21. Flowers

**Temporal Communicative Order**

- **Articulation**
  - 1. Hill
  - 2. Temple Structure
  - 3. Colonial Facades
  - 4. Panchayat Hall Space
  - 5. Street Pattern/Crossing
  - 6. Lingum
  - 7. Murtis
  - 8. Platform
  - 9. Stone Steps
  - 10. Threshold Steps and Facade Adjustments to Houses
  - 11. Tiles
  - 12. Light and Electric
  - 13. Plastering and Concreting
  - 14. Aluminium Roof
  - 15. Shade Structures
  - 16. Murti Dresses
  - 17. Posters
  - 18. Stickers
  - 19. Flowers
  - 20. Paint
  - 21. Flowers

**Civic Possibilities**

- The market platform is regularly painted, and as it is increasingly used for meetings regarding non-religious matters such as health visits, the signage reflects this.
- The temple is repainted every year.
- The panchayat building has a colonial façade that has been described – the round neoclassical arches imply an orientation to the secular, rather than the religious. This is still reflected in the way that political posters are stuck onto the front of this building, while religious posters are stuck onto the temple.
- The temple is repainted every year.
- The market platform is regularly painted, and as it is increasingly used for meetings regarding non-religious matters such as health visits, the signage reflects this.
- The temple is repainted every year.
- The panchayat building has a colonial façade that has been described – the round neoclassical arches imply an orientation to the secular, rather than the religious. This is still reflected in the way that political posters are stuck onto the front of this building, while religious posters are stuck onto the temple.

**Temporal Communicative Order**

- **Articulation**
  - 1. Hill
  - 2. Temple Structure
  - 3. Colonial Facades
  - 4. Panchayat Hall Space
  - 5. Street Pattern/Crossing
  - 6. Lingum
  - 7. Murtis
  - 8. Platform
  - 9. Stone Steps
  - 10. Threshold Steps and Facade Adjustments to Houses
  - 11. Tiles
  - 12. Light and Electric
  - 13. Plastering and Concreting
  - 14. Aluminium Roof
  - 15. Shade Structures
  - 16. Murti Dresses
  - 17. Posters
  - 18. Stickers
  - 19. Flowers
  - 20. Paint
  - 21. Flowers

**Civic Possibilities**

- The market platform is regularly painted, and as it is increasingly used for meetings regarding non-religious matters such as health visits, the signage reflects this.
- The temple is repainted every year.
- The panchayat building has a colonial façade that has been described – the round neoclassical arches imply an orientation to the secular, rather than the religious. This is still reflected in the way that political posters are stuck onto the front of this building, while religious posters are stuck onto the temple.
- The temple is repainted every year.
- The market platform is regularly painted, and as it is increasingly used for meetings regarding non-religious matters such as health visits, the signage reflects this.
- The temple is repainted every year.
- The panchayat building has a colonial façade that has been described – the round neoclassical arches imply an orientation to the secular, rather than the religious. This is still reflected in the way that political posters are stuck onto the front of this building, while religious posters are stuck onto the temple.
The murtis are the only other articulate elements with long temporal horizons, made of concrete and purchased from a wholesaler in the Old City. This, along with the fact that there is no shrine within the Lodi arched mandapa, strongly suggests that the site was not used as a temple for a large part of the time between the Lodi sultanate and the present day, and that it was re-used in the later part of the 20th century as a particularly interesting example of how an articulate architectural setting can contribute to sustaining culture.

The rest of the articulation of this setting is made up of paint and tiles. As with the other temples, most of the articulation is a weekly dressing of the murtis and a daily ritual of applying spice dyes to them, with arranging candles and offerings. The one exception is the way that platforms or at the very least rings of bricks or stones are put around important trees – a sign to everybody that the tree is important to somebody, or a group of people – in this case specifically the temple committee, but also more generally to all Hindus. Across Tajganj, I was often alerted to the fact that I was entering a temple garden on seeing such tree platforms.

Articulation

- 1. site location
- 2. bazaar street
- 3. shrine
- 4. shrine
- 5. tree
- 6. brass bells/ghanta
- 7. shrine
- 8. shrine
- 9. tiles
- 10. sandstone floor
- 11. light and electric
- 12. plants
- 13. plants
- 14. plastering and concreting
- 15. paint
- 16. paint
- 17. murti dresses
- 18. stickers
- 19. flowers
- 20. flowers
- 21. ghanta

Temporal Communicative Order / Civic Possibilities

The places within the site include several shrines of varying ages, the oldest being the domed 2 square meter enclosed shrine to Shiva: this dome is supposedly at least 490 years old due to the petal-like carving and the way that the base is supported on an octagonal drum (Peck, 2011). This is a dome from the Deccan (southern area for South). It is a classical Indo-Islamic style dome, likely to be from the 13th or 14th century.

The plan was probably for a shrine to Shiva, and its age indicates that the site was re-used at some point in the 16th century. The dating of the shrine is confirmed by the fact that there is no dated inscription on the dome (Peck, 2011). This is a shrine to Shiva, and it is likely that the site was re-used at some point in the 16th century. The dating of the shrine is confirmed by the fact that there is no dated inscription on the dome (Peck, 2011).

It is likely that the newer (20th century) shrines have been built to embody worship determined by the position of sacred trees. Again, the shrine to Hanuman is built at the side of a betel tree, while the shrine to Shiva and Kali is built in front of a neem tree – often associated with Durga or her manifestation as Kali.
Spatial Differentiation, 1914: variety of rooms to mediate between meetings between home-owner and merchants, between the resident family and other visiting friends and family, and rooms purely for the resident family.

Spatial Differentiation, Event One: so much of the house is ruined that it is either unsafe for guests or the resident family do not want guests to see these spaces; not enough mediation between private family space and event space for the family to be comfortable allowing an open invite to event.

Spatial Differentiation, Event Two - opportunity for a wider variety of people to feel welcome (women's area and area for Sikawar residents becomes apparent).

Spatial Differentiation, Proposed Conservation Plan: drawing upon new vision of resident family, and the proceedings of Event 2.

*Buskh Museum* Civic Possibilities: Opportunity to Encounter Difference
Proposed Repairs Prohibited by ASI - inability for CURE, myself, Buksh family to negotiate conditions.

Sikawar residents negotiate exhibition at Level 06 with Buksh family, myself, consistent collaborators.

Women adjust terrace conditions to mediate visibility to create appropriate conditions for gathering - negotiation between the female members of Buksh family, female friends, other members of Buksh family, myself, male consistent collaborators.

Consistent Collaborators adjust surfaces and shade to create appropriate conditions for gathering - negotiation between Consistent Collaborators, Buksh family, myself, CURE.

Behaviour of collaborators and guests is watched over by Maulvi - negotiation between all participants and Maulvi.

**Buskh Museum** Civic Possibilities: Opportunity to Negotiate Urban Conditions - Hosted Places
Proposed Repairs Granted by the ASI - negotiation between ASI, CURE architects, myself, Buksh family

Additions not considered 'construction' on Level 01 - negotiation between Buksh family

Meeting Place for women's savings groups on rooftop - negotiation between savings group, CURE, Buksh family, myself, architecture students

Museum Exhibition and Internet Cafe - negotiation between craftpeople, Buksh family, CURE, myself, architecture students

Cyclical Museum Event - negotiation between Buksh family, craftpeople, Mosque Committee, Press, Tourism Board, myself, CURE, architecture students

**Buskh Museum** Civic Possibilities: Opportunity to Negotiate Urban Conditions - Proposed Conservation Plan
Fabric and bamboo structures: last for two days

Gardening: lasts for six months

Earth Floor: lasts for one week

Exhibition and ornament: in place for one day

Buskh Museum Temporality of Communicative Order: “Short-term” Adjustments Made During Event
Buskh Museum Temporality of Communicative Order: Proposed “Long-term” Adjustments

Repaired: replaced every fifty years (maintained yearly)

Meeting structures: replaced every five years

Non-structural adjustments: replaced every two years

Cyclical Event: replaced every year

Articulation

- View of the mosque
- Colonial articulation
- Furniture
- Door, window, and ceiling
- New doors, windows, false ceiling, built-in furniture
- New roof, marble floors, new tiling, new walls, WC
- Lighting and electric
- Plastering and concret

Repairs to structure: replaced every fifty years (maintained yearly)

Non-structural adjustments: replaced every ten years

Meeting structures: replaced every five years

Cyclical Event: replaced every year

Buskh Museum Temporality of Communicative Order: Proposed “Long-term” Adjustments